

History 353a  
Comparative Colonialisms: North and South America  
Professors Herzog and Winterer  
Fall 2006  
Tuesdays, 12:15-2:05

Professor Tamar Herzog  
office: 242  
e-mail: [therzog@stanford.edu](mailto:therzog@stanford.edu)

Professor Caroline Winterer  
office: 319  
e-mail: [cwinterer@stanford.edu](mailto:cwinterer@stanford.edu)

Overview: This class is a graduate colloquium involving both primary and secondary sources. We will investigate the colonial period—focusing mostly on the eighteenth century—of both North and South America. Our aim will be to open a conversation about continuities and differences in the colonization of the Americas, and also to explore the prospects and limitations of comparative historiographies of this time and region.

Requirements: Students are expected to attend discussion and to participate actively. Please note that we will begin discussion on the first class meeting—you will be expected to have completed the assigned reading by that day. Each week, a few students will lead class discussion; we'll choose groups on the first day of class, and the presenting students will be responsible for coming to class with a series of questions with which to launch discussion. On the last day of class, students will hand in a 10-page (double-spaced, 12-point font, stapled) paper on one of the following three topics. 1.) You can analyze the historiography of North American/South American comparisons, 2) you can do a North/South comparison of the historiography of some particular topic (slavery, religion, etc.) ; 3.) you can discuss the historiographical debate on the methodologies of comparative history. We will devote this final class session to a discussion of all the students' papers, so please come prepared to contribute your ideas.

Grading: final paper (50%); class discussion (25%); discussion-leading day (25%)

Books available for purchase at Stanford University Bookstore:

The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olauda Equiano, in The Classic Slave Narratives, ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. (Signet, 2002).

Bartolomé de las Casas, A Short Account of the Destruction of the Indies (London: Penguin, 1999).

Richard White, The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-1815 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991).

Catalina de Erauso, Memoir of a Basque Lieutenant Nun. Transvestite in the New World, Michele Stepto and Gabriel Stepto eds. (Boston: Beacon Press, 1996)

Jack P. Greene, Pursuits of Happiness: The Social Development of Early Modern British Colonies and the Formation of American Culture (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988).

Mary Rowlandson, The Sovereignty and Goodness of God (1682; repr. New York: Bedford, 1997), 62-112.

Schedule of Readings
----------------------

Week 1 (Sept. 26): Comparative History
--

William H. Sewell, "Marc Bloch and the Logic of Comparative History." History and Theory 6(2) (1967): 208-218. Available online.

Raymond Grew, "The Case for Comparing Histories." The American Historical Review 85(4)(1980): 763-778. Available online.

Jürgen Kocka, "Comparison and Beyond." History and Theory 42 (2003): 39-44. Available online.

Chris Lorenz. "Comparative Historiography: Problems and Perspectives." History and Theory 38 (1) (1999): 25-39. Available online.

Ann Laura Stoler, "Tense and Tender Ties. The Politics of Comparison in (Post) Colonial Studies." Itinerario 27 (3-4) (2003): 263-284.

Week 2 (Oct. 3): Slaves and Freed Africans, I
---

Magnus Mörner, "African Slavery in Spanish and Portuguese America: Some Remarks on Historiography and the Present State of Research." In Wolfgang Binder ed. Slavery in the Americas (Würzburg: Königshausen und Neumann, 1993), 57-87.

Matthew Restall, "Black Conquistadors: Armed Africans in Early Spanish America." The Americas 57(2) (2000): 171-205. Available online.

Lolita Gutiérrez Brockington, "The Africa Diaspora in the Eastern Andes: Adaptation, Agency and Fugitive Action, 1573-1677." The Americas 57(2) (2000): 207-224. Available online.

Kris Lane, "Captivity and Redemption: Aspects of Slave Life in Early Colonial Quito and Popayán." The Americas 57(2) (2000): 225-246. Available online.

Thomas Fiehrer, "Slaves and Freedmen in Colonial Central America: Rediscovering a Forgotten Black Past." The Journal of Negro History 64(1) (1979): 39-57. Available online.

Stanley M. Elkins, "Culture Contacts and Negro Slavery." Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society 107 (2) (1963): 107-109. Available online.

Sources:

“Spain’s Code Noir (1574),” in Documents of West Indian History. Eric Williams ed. Port of Spain: PNM, 1963, v.1, 151-154.

Tomas Mercado and Bartolomé de Albornoz, in Eric Williams ed. Documents of West Indian History (Port of Spain: PNM, 1963), v.1, 158-162.

“Felipe Edimboro Sues for Manumission, Don Francisco Xavier Sánchez Contests (Florida, 1794),” in Richard Boyen and Geoffrey Spurling eds. Colonial Lives. Documents on Latin American History, 1550-1850. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), 249-268.

Week 3 (Oct. 10) Slavery and Freed Africans, II
---

John Thornton, “Cannibals, Witches, and Slave Traders in the Atlantic World,” William and Mary Quarterly 60 (2003), 273-94. Available online.

Lois Green Carr, “The Chesapeake Slave Trade: Regional Patterns, African Origins, and Some Implications,” William and Mary Quarterly 58 (2001): 139-70. Available online.

Bretth Rushforth, “A Little Flesh We Offer You’: The Origins of Indian Slavery in New France,” William and Mary Quarterly 60 (Oct. 2003): 777-808. Available online.

Christopher Brown, “Empire without Slaves: British Concepts of Emancipation in the Age of the American Revolution,” William and Mary Quarterly 56 (April 1999): 273-306. Available online.

Randy Sparks, “Two Princes of Calabar: An Atlantic Odyssey from Slavery to Freedom,” William and Mary Quarterly 59 (2002): 555-84. Available online.

Ira Berlin, “From Creole to African: Atlantic Creoles and the Origins of African-American Society in Mainland North America,” William and Mary Quarterly 53 (1996): 251-88. Available online.

Source:

The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olauda Equiano, in The Classic Slave Narratives, ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. (Signet, 2002), 3-182. You may use another edition of this text. It is also available online: <http://www.inmotionaame.org/> (go to “Texts,” then “The Transatlantic Slave Trade”).

Week 4 (Oct. 17) Indians, I
-----------------------------

Charles Gibson, Spain in America (New York: Harper and Row, 1966), 136-159 (chapter 7: “Spaniards and Indians”).

Sources

Bartolomé de las Casas, A Short Account of the Destruction of the Indies (London: Penguin, 1999), especially 3-13 and 127-130.

Felipe Guamán Poma de Ayala, Primer nueva crónica y buen gobierno (1615).

Available online in both Spanish and English: <http://www.kb.dk/elib/mss/poma/> and in CD-ROM.

Week 5 (Oct. 24): Indians, II

Richard White, The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-1815 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991);

Michael A. McDonnell, "Charles-Michel Mouet de Langlade: Warrior, Soldier, and Intercultural "Window" on the Sixty-Years' War for the Great Lakes," in The Sixty Years' War for the Great Lakes, 1754-1814 (East Lansing: Wayne State University Press 2001), 79-103.

Week 6 (Oct. 31): Urban Life, I
---------------------------------

Lyle N. McAlister, Spain and Portugal in the New World. 1492-1700, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984), 133-152 (chapter 7; "Instruments of Colonization: The Castilian *Municipio*).

María Elena Martínez, "Space, Order and Group Identities in a Spanish Colonial Town: Pueblo de los Angeles," In Luis Roniger and Tamar Herzog eds. The Collective and the Public in Latin America. Cultural Identities and Political order (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2000), 13-36.

Sources:

Jorge Juan and Antonio Ulloa, A Voyage to South America, [1735] (Dublin, 1765), v.2, book 1, chapters 3 and 4, pp.30-48.

Chronicles of Colonial Lima. The Diary of Joseph and Francisco Mugaburu, 1640-1697, Robert Ryal Miller trans. and ed. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1975), 12-24.

Catalina de Erauso, Memoir of a Basque Lieutenant Nun. Transvestite in the New World, Michele Stepto and Gabriel Stepto eds. (Boston: Beacon Press, 1996).

Week 7 (Nov. 7), Urbanity (CW ALONE)
--------------------------------------

Jack P. Greene, Pursuits of Happiness: The Social Development of Early Modern British Colonies and the Formation of American Culture (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988).

T. H. Breen, "Baubles of Britain: The American Consumer Revolution," Past and Present 119 (May 1988): 73-104. Available online.

Sources:

Benjamin Franklin, "Observations Concerning the Increase of Mankind" (1751), in Leonard W. Labaree, ed., The Papers of Benjamin Franklin (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959), 4: 227-34.

Week 8 (Nov. 14) Female Piety (Latin America) (TH ALONE)

Asunción Lavrin, "In Search of the Colonial Woman in Mexico: The Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries, In Asunción Lavrin ed., Latin American Women. Historical Perspectives (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1978), 23-59.

Ruth Behar, "Sexual Witchcraft, Colonialism and Women's Powers," in Asunción Lavrin ed., Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989), 178-206.

Susan M. Deeds, "Subverting the Social Order. Gender, Power and Magic in Nueva Vizcaya," in Jesús F. de la Teja and Ross Frank eds., Choice, Persuasion and Coercion. Social Control on Spain's North American Frontiers (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005), 95-119.

Kathleen Ann Myers, Neither Saints nor Sinners. Writing the Lives of Women in Spanish America (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), 23-43 AND 93-115. (The first chapter on pp.23-43 was also published in Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff eds., Colonial Saints. Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800. (New York: Routledge, 2003), 251-275).

Sources:

Kenneth Mills and William Taylor, Colonial Spanish America: A Documentary History, (Wilmington: Scholarly Press, 1998), 194-213.

No Class during Thanksgiving Week

Week 9 (Nov. 28) Female Piety, North America

John Demos, Entertaining Satan: Witchcraft and the Culture of Early New England (Oxford University Press, 1982), pp. 57-94

Carol Karlsen, The Devil in the Shape of a Woman: Witchcraft in Colonial New England (repr. New York: Norton, 1987), 77-84, 101-16.

Susan Juster, "Introduction," in Disorderly Women: Sexual Politics and Evangelicalism in Revolutionary New England (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994), 1-13.

Laurel Thatcher Ulrich, Good Wives: Image and Reality in the Lives of Women in Northern New England, ch. 5, "The Serpent Beguiled Me," pp. 89-105.

Sources:

Mary Rowlandson, The Sovereignty and Goodness of God (1682; repr. New York: Bedford, 1997), 62-112.

Week 10 (Dec. 5) Discussion: Comparing the History of North and South America

John K. Kicza, "Dealing with Foreigners: A Comparative Essay Regarding Initial Expectations and Interactions between Native Societies and the English in North America and the Spanish in Mexico," Colonial Latin American Historical Review 34(4) (1994): 381-397.

George Raudzens, "Why did Amerindian Defences Fail? Parallels in the European Invasions of Hispaniola, Virginia and Beyond," War in History 3(3) (1996): 331-352.

Alistair Hennessy, "The Nature of the Conquest and the Conquistadors," Proceedings of the British Academy 81 (1993): 5-36.

S.N. Eisenstadt, "Culture, Religion and Development in North American and Latin American Civilizations," International Social Science Review 44(4) (1992): 593-606.

Table of Contents  
Coursepack for History 353a  
Comparative Colonialisms: North and South America  
Professors Herzog and Winterer  
Fall 2006  
Tuesdays, 12:15-2:05

Ann Laura Stoler, "Tense and Tender Ties. The Politics of Comparison in (Post) Colonial Studies." Itinerario 27 (3-4) (2003): 263-284.

Magnus Mörner, "African Slavery in Spanish and Portuguese America: Some Remarks on Historiography and the Present State of Research." In Wolfgang Binder ed. Slavery in the Americas (Würzburg: Königshausen und Neumann, 1993), 57-87.

Tomas Mercado and Bartolomé de Albornoz, in Eric Williams ed. Documents of West Indian History (Port of Spain: PNM, 1963), v.1, 158-162.

"Felipe Edimboro Sues for Manumission, Don Francisco Xavier Sánchez Contests (Florida, 1794)," in Richard Boyen and Geoffrey Spurling eds. Colonial Lives. Documents on Latin American History, 1550-1850. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), 249-268.

Charles Gibson, Spain in America (New York: Harper and Row, 1966), 136-159 (chapter 7: "Spaniards and Indians").

Michael A. McDonnell, "Charles-Michel Mouet de Langlade: Warrior, Soldier, and Intercultural "Window" on the Sixty-Years' War for the Great Lakes," in The Sixty Years' War for the Great Lakes, 1754-1814 (East Lansing: Wayne State University Press 2001), 79-103.

Lyle N. McAlister, Spain and Portugal in the New World. 1492-1700, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984), 133-152 (chapter 7; "Instruments of Colonization: The Castilian *Municipio*").

María Elena Martínez, "Space, Order and Group Identities in a Spanish Colonial Town: Pueblo de los Angeles," In Luis Roniger and Tamar Herzog eds. The Collective and the Public in Latin America. Cultural Identities and Political order (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2000), 13-36.

Jorge Juan and Antonio Ulloa, A Voyage to South America, [1735] (Dublin, 1765), v.2, book 1, chapters 3 and 4, pp.30-48.

Chronicles of Colonial Lima. The Diary of Joseph and Francisco Mugaburu, 1640-1697, Robert Ryal Miller trans. and ed. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1975), 12-24.

Benjamin Franklin, "Observations Concerning the Increase of Mankind" (1751), in Leonard W. Labaree, ed., The Papers of Benjamin Franklin (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959), 4: 227-34.

Asunción Lavrin, "In Search of the Colonial Woman in Mexico: The Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries, In Asunción Lavrin ed., Latin American Women. Historical Perspectives (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1978), 23-59.

Ruth Behar, "Sexual Witchcraft, Colonialism and Women's Powers," in Asunción Lavrin ed., Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989), 178-206.

Susan M. Deeds, "Subverting the Social Order. Gender, Power and Magic in Nueva Vizcaya," in Jesús F. de la Teja and Ross Frank eds., Choice, Persuasion and Coercion. Social Control on Spain's North American Frontiers (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005), 95-119.

Kathleen Ann Myers, Neither Saints nor Sinners. Writing the Lives of Women in Spanish America (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), 23-43 AND 93-115.

Kenneth Mills and William Taylor, Colonial Spanish America: A Documentary History, (Wilmington: Scholarly Press, 1998), 194-213.

John Demos, Entertaining Satan: Witchcraft and the Culture of Early New England (Oxford University Press, 1982), pp. 57-94

Carol Karlsen, The Devil in the Shape of a Woman: Witchcraft in Colonial New England (repr. New York: Norton, 1987), 77-84, 101-16.

Susan Juster, "Introduction," in Disorderly Women: Sexual Politics and Evangelicalism in Revolutionary New England (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994), 1-13.

Laurel Thatcher Ulrich, Good Wives: Image and Reality in the Lives of Women in Northern New England, ch. 5, "The Serpent Beguiled Me," pp. 89-105.



John K. Kicza, "Dealing with Foreigners: A Comparative Essay Regarding Initial Expectations and Interactions between Native Societies and the English in North America and the Spanish in Mexico," Colonial Latin American Historical Review 34(4) (1994): 381-397.

George Raudzens, "Why did Amerindian Defences Fail? Parallels in the European Invasions of Hispaniola, Virginia and Beyond," War in History 3(3) (1996): 331-352.

Alistair Hennessy, "The Nature of the Conquest and the Conquistadors," Proceedings of the British Academy 81 (1993): 5-36.

S.N. Eisenstadt, "Culture, Religion and Development in North American and Latin American Civilizations," International Social Science Review 44(4) (1992): 593-606.

